

∨ User Menu  **Review Report Form**

Home (/user/myprofile)	Journal	Sustainability (https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability) (ISSN 2071-1050)
Manage Accounts (/user/manage_accounts)	Manuscript ID	sustainability-1781335
Change Password (/user/chgpwd)	Type	Article
Edit Profile (/user/edit)	Title	Optimal Residence: Does Air Quality Affect Settlement Decisions of Urban Floating Migrants?
Logout (/user/logout)	Authors	Tongshan Liu , Guoying Han , Wan Nie *
	Section	Sustainable Urban and Rural Development (https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/sections/urban_and_rural_development)

∨ Submissions Menu 

Submit Manuscript (/user/manuscripts/upload)	<p>Abstract</p> <p>There is a strong association between urban prosperity and human resources. Rapid urbanization and industrialization have caused severe air pollution to the urban cities over the past decades, and permanently moving to locations with clean air has been considered to be one of the most effective strategies to avoid air pollution. However, to whom this is the fact and what the mechanism behind this association is still unclear. In order to fill the research gaps, this study combines individual-level data derived from a national survey and city-level data obtained from various sources to empirically exam the effect that air quality has on settlement decisions of urban floating migrants in China. We focus on the target floating migrants who have urban hukou in the origin city and housing in the destination city, and investigate the relationship between air quality and settlement decisions from the move-in and move-out city perspective. In addition, we exam not only the willingness of urban floating migrants to settling in the move-in city, but also their actual migration decision in the reality. The bivariate probit analysis and panel data regression were applied. Results show that poor air quality in the move-out cities has a significant positive impact on urban floating migrants' willingness to settling in the move-in cities, while bad air quality in the move-in cities has a significant negative impact, indicating that poor air quality does act as a push force to drive floating migrants away but the good air quality can be a pull power to attract floating migrants to settling down. In addition, the robust tests showed good agreement with the main regression results, with almost all relationships reported having the same direction as those indicated by the regression analysis. Our findings can help policy makers and urban planners assess and design interventions to improve the urban air quality aimed at attracting talents, with broader implications for urban sustainable development.</p>
Display Submitted Manuscripts (/user/manuscripts/status)	
English Editing (/user/pre_english_article/status)	
Discount Vouchers (/user/discount_voucher)	
Invoices (/user/invoices)	
LaTeX Word Count (/user/get/latex_word_count)	

∨ Reviewers Menu 

Reviews (/user/reviewer/status)
Volunteer Preferences (/volunteer_reviewer_info/new)

Review Report Form



Name Dr. Simon Huston
 Email ad4385@coventry.ac.uk
 Website https://pureportal.coventry.ac.uk/en/persons/simon-huston
 (https://pureportal.coventry.ac.uk/en/persons/simon-huston)
 Affiliation Coventry University, Coventry, United Kingdom
 Research Keywords urban climate; landscape architecture; wind

Editor Profile (/user/edit/editor)
 Decisions (/user/decision/status)
 Pre-check Decisions (/user/pre/check/decision/status)

Report 1 Hide Report and Author Response [-]

	High	Average	Low	Overall Recommendation
	No Answer			() Accept in present form
Originality	(x)	()	()	(x) Accept after minor revision
	()			() Reconsider after major revision
Contribution to Scholarship	()	(x)	()	() Reject
	()			
Quality of Structure and Clarity	(x)	()	()	English language and style
	()			() Extensive editing of English language and style required
Logical Coherence/Strength of Argument/Academic Soundness	(x)	()	()	(x) Moderate English changes required
	()			() English language and style are fine/minor spell check required
Engagement with sources as well as recent scholarship	(x)	()	()	() I don't feel qualified to judge about the English language and style
	()			
Overall Merit	(x)	()	()	
	()			

	Yes	Can be improved	Must be improved	Not applicable
Is the content succinctly described and contextualized with respect to previous and present theoretical background and empirical research (if applicable) on the topic?	(x)	()	()	()
Are all the cited references relevant to the research?	(x)	()	()	()
Are the research design, questions, hypotheses and methods clearly stated?	(x)	()	()	()
Are the arguments and discussion of findings coherent, balanced and compelling?	(x)	()	()	()
For empirical research, are the results clearly presented?	(x)	()	()	()
Is the article adequately referenced?	(x)	()	()	(✓)
Are the conclusions thoroughly supported by the results presented in the article or referenced in secondary literature?	(x)	()	()	()

Comments
and
Suggestions
for Authors

Your paper provides substantive statistical evidence for the fairly obvious conclusion that poor air quality hinders urban migration and talent retention.

I have some suggestions for your consideration *vis a vis* the quality of the communication as indicated below with line numbers.

Cumbersome expression 13 'However, to whom this is the fact and what the mechanism behind this association is' perhaps alter to 'whether this is in fact...?'

Your paper uses a mix of present and past tenses. I think you might review for consistency e.g. 14 still unclear. In order to fill the research gaps, this study **combines** [present tense?]. 23-24 The bivariate probit analysis and panel data regression **were** applied [past simple]

29-31 'but the good air quality can be a pull power to attract floating migrants settling down.' This phrase seems inelegant, consider rephrasing.

35 talents - should be singular in my view

46-48 'strategies of prioritizing industrial economic activities over environmental sustainability have been undertaken for decades and'. This is quite indigestible. I would begin with, 'For decades, industrial economic activities were prioritized over.....?'

For the sake of reader clarity, it might be worth repeating that, counter-intuitively, the higher the air quality index the lower the air quality! This would help some readers understand your result that, p665-667 '1 per cent increase in the air quality index of the move-in city, the willingness of urban floating migrants to stay in the destination city decreases by 0.19 per cent; i

A general overview of tense use and readability might be fruitful?

Less...

	Yes	No
Do you have any potential conflict of interest with regards to this paper?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Did you detect plagiarism?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Did you detect inappropriate self-citations by authors?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>



Do you have any other ethical concerns about () (x)
this study?

Comments for Editors (will not be revealed to authors) This seems a robust statistical analysis urban air quality with important policy implications. A general overview of the paper's readability would be useful to address some of the points indicated above to the authors.

Less...

